Project Delivery Method Selection Guidance

Overview

Purpose of this Presentation
• Provide an overview of the PDMSG
• Identify the following:
  – Process level by Project Cost
  – Approval process
  – Process roles

WSDOT Reform VII
Expand and strengthen construction contracting methods and protocols.

Strategic objective
Implement a thorough risk analysis protocol for choosing the appropriate contracting platform for all WSDOT projects and expand the contract methods available for WSDOT projects.
Previous Selection Process

- Design-Bid-Build was automatic unless an Alternative Delivery Method was pursued
- Design-Build approval was required from WSDOT Chief Engineer
- General Contractor/Construction Manager approval was required through CPARB’s Project Review Committee (PRC)

New Selection Process

- All projects will be evaluated for the optimal Project Delivery Method (PDM);
- The PDMSG evaluates three contracting methods,
  - Design-Bid-Build (DBB);
  - Design-Build (DB);
  - General Contractor/Construction Manager (GCCM).

New Selection Process

- The PDM will be determined in two stages,
  - Probable PDM - during the Project Summary Phase;
  - Final PDM – recommended at 10% Design;
- The PDMSG allows for flexibility in the process,
  - Exceptions to the Guidance;
  - Changes to the Guidance;
New Selection Process

- The selected PDM will be endorsed or approved through the Regions with additional HQ endorsement/approval for larger projects and special cases.
- General Contractor/Construction Manager approval is still required through CPARB’s Project Review Committee (PRC)

Acronyms/Definitions

**PDM** – Project Delivery Method

- Project Delivery Method is the process by which a transportation project is designed and constructed from project definition to closeout.
- Design-Bid-Build, Design-Build and General Contractor/Construction Manager are all Project Delivery Methods.
Acronyms/Definitions

Alternative Project Delivery Method

– A delivery method other than Design-Bid-Build
– For PDM/SG, Design-Build and General Contractor/Construction Manager are Alternative Project Delivery Methods

Probable Project Delivery Method

– A preliminary determination at the Project Summary Phase used for project planning until it can be validated/updated by the Engineering Project Office assigned to the project.

Final Project Delivery Method

– A final determination during preliminary design (~10% - 30%) submitted for approval to use as the delivery method.

CPARB - Capital Projects Advisory Review Board

– The 2005 Legislature created the Capital Projects Advisory Review Board (CPARB) under ESHB 1830 (RCW 39.10) to review alternative public works contracting procedures and provide guidance to state policymakers on ways to further enhance the quality, efficiency and accountability of public works contracting methods.
Acronyms/Definitions

CPARB’s PRC - Project Review Committee
- The 2007 Legislative Session created the Project Review Committee (PRC) through HB 1506(RCW 39.10) to work under CPARB. The PRC is responsible for reviewing and approving Public Body certification and project approval applications for the utilization of General Contractor/Construction Manager (GCCM) and Design/Build (DB) delivery methods of construction.

Questions?

PDMSG Outline

Project Delivery Method Timing and Requirements
- The timing and requirements for different levels of work to determine the Project Delivery Method are integrated with the existing project development process.
PDMSG Outline

Project Evaluation

- All projects are evaluated in two steps.
  - Probable Project Delivery Method
  - Final Project Delivery Method

- The work to determine the Probable PDM and the Final PDM are scalable to the size and complexity of the projects.

• The Probable PDM is determined during the Project Summary Phase.

• The Final PDM is determined by the Region validating, updating or revising the Probable PDM during preliminary design (~10% to 30%).

• The Selection Checklist is an initial tool developed to quickly evaluate projects that are obvious Design-Bid-Build or have an easily determined PDM.

• The Selection Matrix is a type of decision matrix used to determine the PDM for larger, more complex projects or if the Checklist did not determine the PDM.
Pre-Work

Before completing the Probable PDM Selection Process, the Project Engineer should be familiar with:

- The PDMSG Guidance and Appendices
- The PDM Attribute Comparison Spreadsheet (Appendix A.5)
- The Project Summary Package
- The Project Management Plan

Pre-Work

Additionally, before completing the Final PDM Selection Process, the Project Engineer should be familiar with:

- Project attributes and information developed during Preliminary Design;
- Changes to the project since the Probable PDM determination;
- The Probable PDM determination documentation for the Project.

Pre-Work

If the project contract cost is less than $2 Million* for a potential Design-Build contract, then no additional Pre-Work is required.

*This limitation relates to estimated Design-Build contract cost which includes the estimated Construction and Design costs included in the potential Design-Build contract.
Pre-Work

For all other projects, the Project Engineer should complete the following Pre-Work:

• Identify project commitments, decisions and assumptions
• Identify project goals
• Prioritize project goals
• Identify constraints
• Relate project goals to project development goals
• Identify project risks (Selection Matrix)
• Summarize the project information on the Project Delivery Description Worksheet

Project Commitments, Decisions and Assumptions

• **Project Commitments**: Known commitments to the project that may affect project scope, risks, budget or schedule.
• **Project Decisions**: Decisions that cannot be changed due to funding source, project approval, legislative mandate or other sources that may affect project scope, risks, budget or schedule.

Project Commitments, Decisions and Assumptions

• **Project Assumptions**: A deduction based on incomplete project information that may affect the project scope, risks, budget or schedule if incorrect.
Potential Bias

- A key to a successful implementation of PDMSG is an unbiased assessment of projects.
- Potential bias for or against a PDM should be considered or discussed briefly and put aside.
- Awareness of potential bias by the individual or team is the key to being able to consciously discard it.

PDMSG Timing

Questions?
Determining Probable PDM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated Project Cost</th>
<th>Required Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Less than $2 Million*</td>
<td>Part I and IV of Selection Checklist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Equal to or greater than $2 Million* but less than $25 Million</td>
<td>Part I, II, III and IV of Selection Checklist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• $25 Million or greater, or The Checklist does not determine a Probable PDM</td>
<td>Selection Matrix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*This limitation relates to Design-Build Contracts so the estimated contract cost includes Construction and PE costs included in a potential Design-Build contract. Project Cost is used in all other cases.

Probable PDM Process

Probable PDM Endorsement
Probable PDM Endorsement

• Regions control the endorsement of the Probable PDM unless an exception to the guidance is requested or project budget is $25 Million or greater, then;
  – Regional Administrator (RA) recommends and endorses Probable PDM,
  – Assistant State Design Engineer (ASDE) and Assistant State Construction Engineer (ASCE) review and endorse RA recommendation of the Probable PDM.

Questions?

Determining Final PDM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated Project Cost</th>
<th>Required Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than $2 Million*</td>
<td>Validate or Revise Part I and V of Selection Checklist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal to or greater than $2 Million* but less than $25 Million</td>
<td>Validate, Revise or Complete Part I, II, III and V of Selection Checklist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$25 Million or greater but less than $100 Million, or; Validation/Revision of the Checklist does not determine a Final PDM</td>
<td>Validate, Revise or Complete Selection Matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$100 Million or greater, or; Validation/Revision of the Selection Matrix does not determine a Final PDM</td>
<td>Selection Matrix Workshop</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*This limitation relates to Design-Build Contracts as the estimated contract cost includes Construction and PE costs included in a potential Design-Build contract. Project Cost is used in all other cases.
Selection Workshops

- The assistance of a facilitator is strongly encouraged for the Selection Workshops. A facilitator can help keep bias under control and balance the participation of the team in the workshop.

- ASDE and ASCE are participants in the Selection Matrix Workshops.

Documentation

- Justification and backup for the Selection Checklist and Matrix is required for the Probable and Final PDM endorsement and approval processes.

- The documentation of the process and ASCE and ASDE Selection Workshop participation and endorsement provides a transparent process that supports the approval process.

- Regions should involve the ASCE/ASDE early if an exception to the guidance or a change to the approved Final PDM will be requested.

Final PDM Determination Validation/Revision Process
Final PDM Approval Process

- If the Project is less than $100 Million and complies with the guidance; then the Regional Administrator reviews and approves the Final PDM.

- If the Project cost is $100 Million or greater; then
  - The Regional Administrator approves the Final PDM and submits it to HQ for endorsement; and
  - The Assistant State Design Engineer and Assistant State Construction Engineer endorse the Final PDM.
Final PDM Approval Process

• If an exception to the guidance is requested for the Final PDM or the approved Final PDM is changed after 30% Design; then
  – The Regional Administrator endorses the Final PDM and recommends approval to HQ;
  – The Assistant State Design Engineer and Assistant State Construction Engineer review and endorse the Final PDM; and
  – The Chief Engineer reviews and approves the Final PDM (delegated to the Deputy Chief Engineer in the PDMG Letter)

Summary

• All projects will be evaluated using a scalable process;
• PDM is determined in two steps as early as possible to maximize benefits;
  – Probable PDM in Summary Phase
  – Final PDM in Preliminary Design (~10%-30% Design)
• Approval by Regions with HQ involved for larger projects or special cases.

Questions?