

Appendix D – Performance Evaluation Process



PERFORMANCE ATTRIBUTE DEFINITIONS

SR302 / Elgin Clifton Rd to SR16

Performance Attribute	Definition
Improve SR 302 Mainline Ops and Safety	An assessment of traffic operations and safety on the mainline facility. Operational considerations include level of service relative to the 20-year traffic projections as well as geometric considerations such as design speed, sight distance, lane widths and shoulder widths. Add bicycle and pedestrian operations and access?
Improve Local Operations and Safety	An assessment of traffic operations and safety on the local roadway infrastructure, including on-ramps and frontage roads. Operational considerations include level of service relative to the 20-year traffic projections; geometric considerations such as design speed, sight distance, lane widths; bicycle and pedestrian operations and access.
Arch / Cultural / 4(f) / Ag / LU	An assessment of the impacts to Archeological, Cultural, 4(f) and 6(f), Agricultural, and Land Use by each alternative.
Relo / Social / EJ / Visual / Noise	An assessment of any relocations required by the alternatives and impacts to social (including visual and noise) and economic issues including any impacts relating to environmental justice.
Wetlands / Wildlife & Terrestrial Habitat	An assessment of the Wetlands, Wildlife Forest, and Terrestrial Habitat impacted by the alternatives.
Fish / Surface Water / Aquatics Habitat	An assessment of the Aquatic Habitat, Surface Water, and Fisheries impacted by the alternative.
Project Schedule / Phasing	An assessment of the feasibility of the project; the likelihood of receiving funding; and the length of time to construct the project. An assessment of the opportunity to phase construction of the project to minimize impacts while realizing increased benefit.
Improve Travel Times	An assessment of the improvement to travel time from the West end of project to SR16 as compared to existing condition.



PERFORMANCE ATTRIBUTE SCALES	
SR302 / Elgin Clifton Rd to SR16	
Performance Attribute Scales	
Using a score of 1 as lowest and 10 as highest. Define the rationale for a score of 1, 5 and 10 for each attribute.	
Performance Attribute	Performance Rationale
Improve SR 302 Mainline Ops and Safety	5=Meets LOS and minimal deviation to design standards and addresses safety concerns.
Improve Local Operations and Safety	5=Meets LOS and minimal deviation to local design standards and addresses safety concerns.
Arch / Cultural / 4(f) / Ag / LU	1=Major arch, cultural, 4(f) and land use impacts; 5=Mitigatable Impacts; 10=Minimal arch, cultural, 4(f), agricultural, and land use impacts
Relo / Social / EJ / Visual / Noise	1=Large amount of relocations required and major environmental justice and social impacts; 10=No relocations required, minimal environmental justice and social impacts.
Wetlands / Wildlife & Terrestrial Habitat	1=Major wetland, wildlife forest and terrestrial habitat impacts; 5=Mitigatable Impacts; 10=Minimal wetland, wildlife forest and terrestrial habitat impacts
Fish / Surface Water / Aquatics Habitat	1=Major fisheries, surface water, and aquatic habitat impacts; 5=Mitigatable Impacts; 10=Minimal fisheries, surface water, and aquatic habitat impacts
Project Schedule / Phasing	1=Not likely to occur / >= five years and little or no phasing opportunities; 10=Highly likely to occur / <= five years and many opportunities to phasing.
Improve Travel Times	5= No improvement over existing travel time from Key Peninsula Hwy to SR16.



PERFORMANCE ATTRIBUTE MATRIX
SR302 / Elgin Clifton Rd to SR16

Which attribute will provide the greater improvement to the project relative to Purpose and Need?

									TOTAL	%
Improve SR 302 Mainline Ops and Safety	A	A	A	A	A	A	A	A	8.0	22.2%
Improve Local Operations and Safety	B	BC	BD	BE	BF	G	BH		3.5	9.7%
Arch / Cultural / 4(f) / Ag / LU		C	C	CE	CF	C	C		5.5	15.3%
Relo / Social / EJ / Visual / Noise			D	E	F	DG	D		3.0	8.3%
Wetlands / Wildlife & Terrestrial Habitat				E	EF	E	E		5.5	15%
Fish / Surface Water / Aquatics Habitat					F	F	F		5.5	15%
Project Schedule / Phasing						G	GH		3.0	8%
Improve Travel Times							H		2.0	6%
								36	36.0	100%



SR302 / Elgin Clifton Rd to SR16

Attribute	Attribute Weight	Concept	Performance Rating										Total Performance	
			1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10		
Improve SR 302 Mainline Ops and Safety	22	Alt #3 - Power Line			3									67
		Alt #4 - North Bridge								7				156
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal			3									67
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th					5							111
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave								7				156
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves			3									67
Improve Local Operations and Safety	10	Alt #3 - Power Line								7			68	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge									9		88	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal						6					58	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th			3								29	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave						6					58	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves					5						49	
Arch / Cultural / 4(f) / Ag / LU	15	Alt #3 - Power Line				4							61	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge			3								46	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal		2									31	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th				4							61	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave		2									31	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves		2									31	
Relo / Social / EJ / Visual / Noise	8	Alt #3 - Power Line		2									17	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge			3								25	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal					5						42	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th			3								25	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave			3								25	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves			3								25	
Wetlands / Wildlife & Terrestrial Habitat	15	Alt #3 - Power Line			3								46	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge				4							61	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal					5						76	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th			3								46	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave					5						76	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves			3								46	
Fish / Surface Water / Aquatics Habitat	15	Alt #3 - Power Line			3								46	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge			3								46	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal						6					92	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th					5						76	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave			3								46	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves			3								46	
Project Schedule / Phasing	8	Alt #3 - Power Line				4							33	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge				4							33	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal						6					50	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th						6					50	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave						6					50	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves			3								25	
Improve Travel Times	6	Alt #3 - Power Line						6					33	
		Alt #4 - North Bridge						6					33	
		Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal				4							22	
		Alt #7 - Pine/118th				4							22	
		Alt #10 - 154th Ave					5						28	
		Alt #11 - Wauna Curves						6					33	

OVERALL PERFORMANCE Existing Alignment	Performance (P)	Cost (C)	Value Index (P/C)
Alt #3 - Power Line	371	\$122M	3.04
Alt #4 - North Bridge	488	\$95M	5.13
Alt #6 - Pine Diagonal	438	\$42M	10.42
Alt #7 - Pine/118th	421	\$50M	8.42
Alt #10 - 154th Ave	469	\$84M	5.59
Alt #11 - Wauna Curves	321	\$217M	1.48